CnW/ASCW/DSCW/O/260416/0226

SOPC(C&W)5-17/2026(PPP)(General)
GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB
COMMUNICATION & WORKS
DEPARTMENT
Lahore,
Dated: 16th April, 2026

To,

1. Chief Executive Officer
   Punjab Public Private Partnership Authority
2. Chief Engineer Special Initiative
   Chief Engineer Special Initiative Department
3. ***Mr. Nayyar Saeed, Consultant for PPPs in C&W Department,***
   Near o/o Superintending Engineer, Highways Circle, Lahore.

Subject: **MINUTES OF MEETING OF BID OPENING AND EVALUATION COMMITTEE (BOEC) FOR MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS (5-GROUPS / 9-NO. ROADS) UNDER PPP MODE**

I am directed to **enclose** a copy of Minutes of Meeting held on 15.04.2026 at 12:30 pm & 01:00 pm under the chairmanship of Additional Secretary (Technical – III), C&W in his office in C&W Department, Lahore on the subject noted above, for information and further required action.

CnW sopc.cnw
110.39.190.186 16/4/2026
4:32:50 PM

(RIFFAT HINA)
SOPC - CNW
SOPC - CNW

CC:
A copy is forwarded for information and necessary action to the:-

1. Special Secretary (C&W) , (Minister Office CWD)
   Communication & Works Department
2. AS (T-III) - CnW , (AS (T-III) - CnW)
   Communication & Works Department

MINUTES OF MEETING OF BID OPENING AND EVALUATION COMMITTEE (BOEC) FOR MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS (5-GROUPS/ 9-NO. ROADS) UNDER PPP MODE

The meeting on the subject was held on 15.04.2026(Wednesday) at 12:30pm under the chairmanship of Additional Secretary (Technical – III), C&W in Committee Room of C&W Department, Lahore.***(List of participants is attached)***.

2. The following "Bid Opening and Evaluation Committee (**BOEC**)" was notified, in light of Rule 78 of "Punjab Public Private Partnership Rules 2025", vide C&W Notification dated 11.03.2026;

i.	Additional Secretary (Tech-III), C&W Department	(Convener)
ii.	Deputy Secretary (PC), C&W Department	(Member/Secretary)
iii.	Representative of Chief Engineer, Punjab Special Initiatives Department	(Member)
iv.	Representative of PPP Authority, Government of the Punjab	(Member)
v.	Mr. Nayyar Saeed, Consultant PPP, C&W Department	(Member)
vi.	Any other co-opted member(s)	(Member)

Mr. Khalid Javed, Specialist Road Sector Projects was nominated as representative of "Punjab Public Private Partnership Authority (P4A)" and Mr. M. Shahbaz, Deputy Director (PPP) was nominated as representative of "Chief Engineer, Punjab Special Initiatives Department" to attend the subject meeting.

3. The meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chair welcomed the participants.The participants were informed that "Punjab Financial Advisory Services (PFAS) Authority" being the Transaction Advisor (TA) evaluated the Technical Bid Documents and a report was submitted for BOEC approval (***copy attached***). The details are as under;

Sr.	Grp	Roads	Bidders	Result
i	1	Muridke – Narowal (80 KM) Narowal – Shakkar Garh (33 KM)	Kainatt Enterprises	Technically Qualified
			ZKB	Technically Qualified
ii	3	Bahawalpur – Yazman (42 KM) Yazman – Ahmadpur (43 KM)	Kainatt Enterprises	Technically Qualified
			ZKB	Technically Qualified
iii	7	Raiwind – Changa Manga (28 KM) Gujjumatta Kasur Road (26 KM)	Kainatt Enterprises	Technically Qualified
			ZKB	Technically Qualified
iv	10	Faisalabad – Sumundari – Rajhana (56 KM) Canal Expressway Faisalabad (52 KM)	Kainatt Enterprises	Technically Qualified
			ZKB	Technically Qualified
			SARCO	Technically Qualified
v	11	Faisalabad Ring Road (97 KM)	Kainatt Enterprises	Technically Qualified
			ZKB	Technically Qualified

4. The bids were invited on "Single Stage, Three Envelope" bidding procedure under "Punjab Public Private Partnership (PPPP) Rules 2025". The Committee,during subsequent meeting held at 01:00 pm, announced the results of Technical Bid evaluation process in presence of representatives of the above mentioned firms. The Financial Bids of said technically qualified firms were opened by the Committee. The results are as under;

Grp	ZKB	% share	Kainatt Ent.	% share	SARCO	% share	Reserve Price
1	364,669,278	50.50	94,707,798	13.49	-	-	0
3	314,085,013	40.50	10,464,340	3.00	-	-	0
7	919,349,819	55.50	196,046,948	21.32	-	-	230,000,000
10	833,465,946	66.50	282,220,721	21.01	153,589,558	13.10	383,000,000
11	1,033,828,380	68.50	299,894,354	23.68	-	-	453,000,000

5. The Committee requested PFAS representatives to compile the report in light of PPPP Rules to proceed further.

6. Meeting ended with a vote of thanks.

COMMUNICATION & WORKS DEPARTMENT

MEETING OF BID OPENING AND EVALUATION COMMITTEE (BOEC)

FOR MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS (5-GROUPS/ 9-NO. ROADS) UNDER PPP MODE

15th APRIL, 2026 (12:30 p.m) for Technical Documents evaluation

15th APRIL, 2026 (01:00 p.m) for opening of Financial Bids

ATTENDANCE SHEET

Sr. No.	Name	Designation	Department / Firm	Contact #	Signature
1	Syed Moazzam Abbas Jafri	AST-III	C&W	03004479387	
2	M. AMMAR	DS(PC)	C&W	0343-4870657	
3	Nayyar Saeed	Consultant PPP	C&W	0334-4231223	
4	Khalid Javed	Spacialist	P&A	0333-4124688	
5	M. SHAHBAZ.	Road Sector Project DD(PPP) SED	C&W	0334-4376670	
6	Husnain Siddiq	Sr. Manager	PFAS	0342-8119118	
7	Amjed Mustafa	Sr. Manager	PFAS	0334-3610333	
8	Aizaz Khan	Dir. Investments	ZKB	0321-8430132	
9	Ulayk Khan	Mgr	Kainatt	0332 2666810	
10	M. Naeem	G.M.	Kainatt	0334-6068233	
11	Hamza Shahid	G.M	SARCO	0321-3227788	
12					

SUMMARY OF SCORE EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODE

GROUP-1

I- MURIDKE - NAROWAL

II- NAROWAL - SHAKKAR GARH

Project Cost Rs. 5,00 Miilion (Approx)

Pass Marks : 70

Sr. No.	Firm Name	Financial Position (Max Marks =30)			Work Experience (Max Marks = 40)			Understanding & Innovation / Methodology (Max Marks = 10)			Project Team (Max Marks = 10)	Machinery (Max Score = 10)	Technical Score	Remarks
		AACT	NET WORTH	Total	Number of similar assignments	Value of similar assignments	Total	Work Programme	Work Methodology	Total				
1	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	12.00	20.00	**32.00**	3.50	4.10	**7.60**	**7.00**	**7.00**	**83.60**	**Qualified**
1	M/s ZKB	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	12.00	20.00	**32.00**	4.38	3.20	**7.58**	**8.50**	**10.00**	**88.08**	**Qualified**

AddlSecretary Tech III
Communication & Works Department

Rep. of
PPP Authority

Deputy Secretary (PC)
Communication & Works Department

Deputy Director PPP
Special Initiative
Department

Nayyar Saeed
PPP Consultant
C&W Department

Financial Soundness				
Criteria	**M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**		**M/s ZKB**	
	Value (Rs. In Million)	**SCORE**	**Value**	**SCORE**
Average Annual Turnover for last 3-years (as latest Audited accounts) of the Bidder or in the case of the Bidder being a JV/Consortium the aggregate of all the members of the JV Consortium				
For Annual Turnover of PKR 1,000,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Twenty Billion) (10 Marks)	7,192	10	23,209	10
For each increment of Rs. (Pakistan Rupees Fifty Million) (1 Mark) upto a maximum of 5 Marks	6,000	5	22,000	5
	AACT Marks	**15**		**15**
Minimum Net Worth of the Bidder or in the case of the Bidder being a JV/Consortium the aggregate of all the members of the JV Consortium				
For minimum net worth of PKR 350,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Three Fifty Million) (10 Marks)	9,378	10	61,076	10
For each increment of PKR 10,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Ten Million) (1 Mark upto a maximum of 5 Marks)	8,000	5	60,000	5
	Net Worth Marks	**15**		**15**
Financial Soundness Total Marks		**30**		**30**

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Link Bridge over River Indus connection Jhirk (Distt. Thatta and Mullah katiyar Dist6 Tando Mohd Khan) including approach roads and Construdtion of River Training Works	Strong		10 yrs	5128.000	>100%

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	2	12

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	7.00
	Total	**10**	**7.00**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification Experience	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Abdul Shakoor Palijo	1		No		>20	0.00
		Aslam Pervaiz Sh.	1	Yes			>20	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Shahzad Shakoor	2		Y		5<and>8	1.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Hasan Mustafa	1		CMA /Y		>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mr. Naseer Ahmad	1	LLB / Y			>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Shakeel Palijo	2		Y		>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Ghulam Mustafa Palijo	2	Y			>20	2.00
Total:			10					7

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile M/s ZKB

Sr-No-	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Flyover at Kahna Kacha in PPP Mode	Strong		10 yrs	2994.000	>100%

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	2	12

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM M/s ZKB

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	8.50
	Total	**10**	**8.50**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Ahmad Luqman Sarwsr	2		Y		>20	1.00
		Dr Muhammad Zeeshan			Y		<10	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Kashif Khursheed	2		Y		>20	2.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Arslan Vardag	1		FCA	CA	>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mohammad Naeem Akbar Awan	1	LLB			5<and>8	0.50
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Maznzoor Ahmad Qureshi	2	Y/N			>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Abdul Latif	2	Y			>20	2.00
Total:			**10**					**8.50**

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-1I- MURIDKE - NAROWALII- NAROWAL - SHAKKAR GARH

UNDERSTANDING & INNOVATIVENESS / METHODOLOGY & WORK PLAN

1- Work Programme (5 Marks)

Sr. No.	CRITERIA	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	M/s ZKB
		WORK PROGRAMME	WORK PROGRAMME
1	How in-depth is the statement of Project Approach: does it fully cover the scope of the assignment and is it sufficiently developed to ensure assignment completion	0.8	0.83
2	Electronic Toll and Traffic Management (ETTMS)	0.6	0.75
3	Standard Operating Procedures (SOP)	0.5	0.8
4	Maintenance and Asset Preservation	0.5	0.8
5	Risk Identification, Mitigation,Traffic and Management	0.3	0.7
	Quaity and Environmental Management	0.8	0.5
5	**Total Weight:**	**3.50**	**4.38**

2- Work Methodology (5 Marks)

Sr. No.	CRITERIA	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	M/s ZKB
		WORK METHODOLOGY	WORK METHODOLOGY
1	How in-depth is the statement of Project Approach: does it fully cover the scope of the assignment and is it sufficiently developed to ensure assignment completion	0.5	1
2	Quality Management and Method Statement	0.8	0.5
3	What is level of identification of potential risks that will affect the execution of the assignment, and what is the quality of the mitigation strategies proposed?	0.8	0.9
4	Traffic Diversion and Management	1	0.5
5	Safety and Environmental Management	1	0.3
	Total Weight:	**4.10**	**3.20**

Equipment

Sr No	Name of Machinery	Req. No	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES		M/s ZKB	
				Ownership		Ownership
1	Front End Loader 1.5m3	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
2	Dumper	3	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
3	Grader 140 HP	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
4	Combination Roller	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
5	Water Tank Tow Type inc Tractor	3	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
6	Static Tandem Roller	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
7	PTR 9 wheeler	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
8	Tractor	2	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
9	Concrete Mixer	1	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
10	Excavator Track / wheel type	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
	Obtained Marks		**7**		**10**	

If the Bidder possesses all the key equipment: 10 marks.

Note:

1. The marks mentioned in the above table are for owned equipment.
2. Total equipment available with the bidder is to be listed along with its current
3. The bidder must submit ownership documents for equipment owned by it.
4. For Leased/Rental equipment, the bidder must submit lease/rental agreement(s).
5. For leased/rental equipment the bidder will get 50% marks.

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-1I- MURIDKE - NAROWALII- NAROWAL - SHAKKAR GARH

List of Similar Assignments

Name of Firm: - **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of		Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in Million)	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
			Start	Completion			Rs.350.000 M
1		Strong			< 10 yrs		> 80%
2							

Name of Firm: - **M/s ZKB**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of		Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in Million)	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
			Start	Completion			Rs.350.000 M
1		strong			< 10 yrs		> 80%
2							

SUMMARY OF SCORE EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODE
GROUP-3
I- BAHAWALPUR YAZMAN
II- YAZMAN - AHMADPUR

Project Cost Rs. 500 Miilion (Approx)

Pass Marks : 70

Sr. No.	Firm Name	Financial Position (Max Marks =30)			Work Experience (Max Marks = 40)			Understanding & Innovation / Methodology (Max Marks = 10)			Project Team (Max Marks = 10)	Machinery (Max Score = 10)	Technical Score	Remarks
		AACT	NET WORTH	Total	Number of similar assignments	Value of similar assignments	Total	Work Programme	Work Methodology	Total				
1	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	12.00	20.00	**32.00**	3.50	4.10	**7.60**	**7.00**	**7.00**	**83.60**	**Qualified**
1	M/s ZKB	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	12.00	20.00	**32.00**	4.38	3.20	**7.58**	**8.50**	**10.00**	**88.08**	**Qualified**

AddlSecretary Tech III
Communication & Works Department

Rep. of
PPP Authority

Deputy Secretary (PC)
Communication & Works Department

Deputy Director PPP
Special Initiative
Department

Nayyar Saeed
PPP Consultant
C&W Department

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-3I-BAHAWALPUR YAZMANII- YAZMAN - AHMADPUR

Financial Soundness				
Criteria	**M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**		**M/s ZKB**	
	Value (Rs. In Million)	**SCORE**	**Value**	**SCORE**
Average Annual Turnover for last 3-years (as latest Audited accounts) of the Bidder or in the case of the Bidder being a JV/Consortium the aggregate of all the members of the JV Consortium				
For Annual Turnover of PKR 1,000,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Twenty Billion) (10 Marks)	7,192	10	23,209	10
For each increment of Rs. (Pakistan Rupees Fifty Million) (1 Mark) upto a maximum of 5 Marks	6,192	5	22,209	5
	AACT Marks	**15**		**15**
Minimum Net Worth of the Bidder or in the case of the Bidder being a JV/Consortium the aggregate of all the members of the JV Consortium				
For minimum net worth of PKR 350,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Three Fifty Million) (10 Marks)	9,378	10	61,076	10
For each increment of PKR 10,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Ten Million) (1 Mark upto a maximum of 5 Marks)	5,878	5	57,576	5
	Net Worth Marks	**15**		**15**
Financial Soundness Total Marks		**30**		**30**

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Link Bridge over River Indus connection Jhirk (Distt. Thatta and Mullah katiyar Dist6 Tando Mohd Khan) including approach roads and Construdtion of River Training Works	Strong		10 yrs	5128.000	>100%

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	2	12

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	7.00
	Total	**10**	**7.00**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification Experience	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Abdul Shakoor Palijo	1		No		>20	0.00
		Aslam Pervaiz Sh.	1	Yes			>20	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Shahzad Shakoor	2		Y		5<and>8	1.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Hasan Mustafa	1		CMA /Y		>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mr. Naseer Ahmad	1	LLB / Y			>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Shakeel Palijo	2		Y		>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Ghulam Mustafa Palijo	2	Y			>20	2.00
Total:			**10**					**7**

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile M/s ZKB

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Flyover at Kahna Kacha in PPP Mode	Strong		10 yrs	2994.000	>100%

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	2	12

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM M/s ZKB

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	8.50
	Total	**10**	**8.50**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Ahmad Luqman Sarwsr	2		Y		>20	1.00
		Dr Muhammad Zeeshan			Y		<10	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Kashif Khursheed	2		Y		>20	2.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Arslan Vardag	1		FCA	CA	>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mohammad Naeem Akbar Awan	1	LLB			5<and>8	0.50
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Maznzoor Ahmad Qureshi	2	Y/N			>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Abdul Latif	2	Y			>20	2.00
Total:			**10**					**8.50**

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-3I- BAHAWALPUR YAZMANII- YAZMAN - AHMADPUR

UNDERSTANDING & INNOVATIVENESS / METHODOLOGY & WORK PLAN

1- Work Programme (5 Marks)

Sr. No.	CRITERIA	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	M/s ZKB
		WORK PROGRAMME	WORK PROGRAMME
1	How in-depth is the statement of Project Approach: does it fully cover the scope of the assignment and is it sufficiently developed to ensure assignment completion	0.8	0.83
2	Electronic Toll and Traffic Management (ETTMS)	0.6	0.75
3	Standard Operating Procedures (SOP)	0.5	0.8
4	Maintenance and Asset Preservation	0.5	0.8
5	Risk Identification, Mitigation,Traffic and Management	0.3	0.7
	Quaity and Environmental Management	0.8	0.5
5	**Total Weight:**	**3.50**	**4.38**

2- Work Methodology (5 Marks)

Sr. No.	CRITERIA	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	M/s ZKB
		WORK METHODOLOGY	WORK METHODOLOGY
1	How in-depth is the statement of Project Approach: does it fully cover the scope of the assignment and is it sufficiently developed to ensure assignment completion	0.5	1
2	Quality Management and Method Statement	0.8	0.5
3	What is level of identification of potential risks that will affect the execution of the assignment, and what is the quality of the mitigation strategies proposed?	0.8	0.9
4	Traffic Diversion and Management	1	0.5
5	Safety and Environmental Management	1	0.3
	Total Weight:	**4.10**	**3.20**

Equipment

Sr No	Name of Machinery	Req. No	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES		M/s ZKB	
				Ownership		Ownership
1	Front End Loader 1.5m3	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
2	Dumper	3	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
3	Grader 140 HP	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
4	Combination Roller	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
5	Water Tank Tow Type inc Tractor	3	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
6	Static Tandem Roller	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
7	PTR 9 wheeler	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
8	Tractor	2	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
9	Concrete Mixer	1	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
10	Excavator Track / wheel type	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
	Obtained Marks		**7**		**10**	

If the Bidder possesses all the key equipment: 10 marks.

Note:

1 The marks mentioned in the above table are for owned equipment.

2 Total equipment available with the bidder is to be listed along with its current mobilization on on-going projects. The Bidder shall provide further details of proposed items of equipment using the relevant Form provided hereunder.

3 The bidder must submit ownership documents for equipment owned by it.

4 For Leased/Rental equipment, the bidder must submit lease/rental agreement(s).

5 For leased/rental equipment the bidder will get 50% marks.

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-3I- BAHAWALPUR YAZMANII- YAZMAN - AHMADPUR

List of Similar Assignments

Name of Firm: - **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of		Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in Million)	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
			Start	Completion			Rs.350.000 M
1		Strong			< 10 yrs		> 80%
2							

Name of Firm: - **M/s ZKB**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of		Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in Million)	Equivalance to our Assignment
			Start	Completion			Rs.350.000 M
1		strong			< 10 yrs		> 80%
2							

SUMMARY OF SCORE EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODE

GROUP-7

I- RAIWIND - CHANGA MANGA

II- GUJJUMATTA - KASUR

Project Cost Rs. 500 Miilion (Approx)

Pass Marks : 70

Sr. No.	Firm Name	Financial Position (Max Marks =30)			Work Experience (Max Marks = 40)			Understanding & Innovation / Methodology (Max Marks = 10)			Project Team (Max Marks = 10)	Machinery (Max Score = 10)	Technical Score	Remarks
		AACT	NET WORTH	Total	Number of similar assignments	Value of similar assignments	Total	Work Programme	Work Methodology	Total				
1	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	12.00	20.00	**32.00**	3.50	4.10	**7.60**	**7.00**	**7.00**	**83.60**	**Qualified**
1	M/s ZKB	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	12.00	20.00	**32.00**	4.38	3.20	**7.58**	**8.50**	**10.00**	**88.08**	**Qualified**

AddlSecretary Tech III
Communication & Works Department

Rep. of
PPP Authority

Deputy Secretary (PC)
Communication & Works Department

Deputy Director PPP
Special Initiative
Department

Nayyar Saeed
PPP Consultant
C&W Department

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-7I-
RAIWIND - CHANGA MANGAII- GUJJUMATTA - KASUR

Financial Soundness				
Criteria	**M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**		**M/s ZKB**	
	Value (Rs. In Million)	**SCORE**	**Value**	**SCORE**
Average Annual Turnover for last 3-years (as latest Audited accounts) of the Bidder or in the case of the Bidder being a JV/Consortium the aggregate of all the members of the JV Consortium				
For Annual Turnover of PKR 1,000,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Twenty Billion) (10 Marks)	7,192	10	23,209	10
For each increment of Rs. (Pakistan Rupees Fifty Million) (1 Mark) upto a maximum of 5 Marks	6,192	5	22,209	5
	AACT Marks	**15**		**15**
Minimum Net Worth of the Bidder or in the case of the Bidder being a JV/Consortium the aggregate of all the members of the JV Consortium				
For minimum net worth of PKR 350,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Three Fifty Million) (10 Marks)	9,378	10	61,076	10
For each increment of PKR 10,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Ten Million) (1 Mark upto a maximum of 5 Marks)	5,878	5	57,576	5
	Net Worth Marks	**15**		**15**
Financial Soundness Total Marks		**30**		**30**

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Link Bridge over River Indus connection Jhirk (Distt. Thatta and Mullah katiyar Dist6 Tando Mohd Khan) including approach roads and Construdtion of River Training Works	Strong		10 yrs	5128.000	>100%

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	2	12

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	7.00
	Total	**10**	**7.00**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification Experience	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Abdul Shakoor Palijo	1		No		>20	0.00
		Aslam Pervaiz Sh.	1	Yes			>20	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Shahzad Shakoor	2		Y		5<and>8	1.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Hasan Mustafa	1		CMA /Y		>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mr. Naseer Ahmad	1	LLB / Y			>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Shakeel Palijo	2		Y		>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Ghulam Mustafa Palijo	2	Y			>20	2.00
Total:			**10**					**7**

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile **M/s ZKB**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Flyover at Kahna Kacha in PPP Mode	Strong		10 yrs	2994.000	>100%

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	2	12

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM **M/s ZKB**

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	8.50
	Total	**10**	**8.50**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Ahmad Luqman Sarwsr	2		Y		>20	1.00
		Dr Muhammad Zeeshan			Y		<10	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Kashif Khursheed	2		Y		>20	2.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Arslan Vardag	1		FCA	CA	>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mohammad Naeem Akbar Awan	1	LLB			5<and>8	0.50
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Maznzoor Ahmad Qureshi	2	Y/N			>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Abdul Latif	2	Y			>20	2.00
Total:			**10**					**8.50**

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-7I- RAIWIND - CHANGA MANGAII- GUJJUMATTA - KASUR

UNDERSTANDING & INNOVATIVENESS / METHODOLOGY & WORK PLAN

1- Work Programme (5 Marks)

Sr. No.	CRITERIA	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	M/s ZKB
		WORK PROGRAMME	WORK PROGRAMME
1	How in-depth is the statement of Project Approach: does it fully cover the scope of the assignment and is it sufficiently developed to ensure assignment completion	0.8	0.83
2	Electronic Toll and Traffic Management (ETTMS)	0.6	0.75
3	Standard Operating Procedures (SOP)	0.5	0.8
4	Maintenance and Asset Preservation	0.5	0.8
5	Risk Identification, Mitigation,Traffic and Management	0.3	0.7
	Quaity and Environmental Management	0.8	0.5
5	**Total Weight:**	**3.50**	**4.38**

2- Work Methodology (5 Marks)

Sr. No.	CRITERIA	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	M/s ZKB
		WORK METHODOLOGY	WORK METHODOLOGY
1	How in-depth is the statement of Project Approach: does it fully cover the scope of the assignment and is it sufficiently developed to ensure assignment completion	0.5	1
2	Quality Management and Method Statement	0.8	0.5
3	What is level of identification of potential risks that will affect the execution of the assignment, and what is the quality of the mitigation strategies proposed?	0.8	0.9
4	Traffic Diversion and Management	1	0.5
5	Safety and Environmental Management	1	0.3
	Total Weight:	**4.10**	**3.20**

Equipment

Sr No	Name of Machinery	Req. No	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES		M/s ZKB	
				Ownership		Ownership
1	Front End Loader 1.5m3	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
2	Dumper	3	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
3	Grader 140 HP	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
4	Combination Roller	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
5	Water Tank Tow Type inc Tractor	3	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
6	Static Tandem Roller	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
7	PTR 9 wheeler	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
8	Tractor	2	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
9	Concrete Mixer	1	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
10	Excavator Track / wheel type	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
	Obtained Marks		**7**		**10**	

If the Bidder possesses all the key equipment: 10 marks.

Note:

1 The marks mentioned in the above table are for owned equipment.

2 Total equipment available with the bidder is to be listed along with its current mobilization on on-going projects. The Bidder shall provide further details of proposed items of equipment using the relevant Form provided hereunder.

3 The bidder must submit ownership documents for equipment owned by it.

4 For Leased/Rental equipment, the bidder must submit lease/rental agreement(s).

5 For leased/rental equipment the bidder will get 50% marks.

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP
MODEGROUP-7I- RAIWIND - CHANGA MANGAII- GUJJUMATTA - KASUR

List of Similar Assignments

Name of Firm: - **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of		Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in Million)	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
			Start	Completion			Rs.350.000 M
1		Strong			< 10 yrs		> 80%
2							

Name of Firm: - **M/s ZKB**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of		Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in Million)	Equivalance to our Assignment
			Start	Completion			Rs.350.000 M
1		strong			< 10 yrs		> 80%
2							

SUMMARY OF SCORE EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODE
GROUP-10
I- FAISALABAD - SUMUNDARI - RAJHANA
II- CANAL EXPRESSWAY FAISALABAD ROAD

Project Cost Rs. 500 Miilion (Approx)

Pass Marks : 70

Sr. No.	Firm Name	Financial Position (Max Marks =30)			Work Experience (Max Marks = 40)			Understanding & Innovation / Methodology (Max Marks = 10)			Project Team (Max Marks = 10)	Machinery (Max Score = 10)	Technical Score	Remarks
		AACT	NET WORTH	Total	Number of similar assignments	Value of similar assignments	Total	Work Programme	Work Methodology	Total				
1	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	12.00	20.00	**32.00**	3.50	4.10	**7.60**	**7.00**	**7.00**	**83.60**	**Qualified**
2	M/s ZKB	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	12.00	20.00	**32.00**	4.38	3.20	**7.58**	**8.50**	**10.00**	**88.08**	**Qualified**
3	M/s SIACO & SARCO JV	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	20.00	20.00	**40.00**	2.70	2.60	**5.30**	**6.50**	**6.00**	**87.80**	**Qualified**

AddlSecretary Tech III
Communication & Works Department

Rep. of
PPP Authority

Deputy Secretary (PC)
Communication & Works Department

Deputy Director PPP
Special Initiative
Department

Nayyar Saeed
PPP Consultant
C&W Department

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-10I- FAISALABAD - SUMUNDARI - RAJHANAII-CANAL EXPRESSWAY FAISALABAD ROAD

Financial Soundness						
Criteria	**M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**		**M/s ZKB**		**M/s SIACO & SARCO JV**	
	Value (Rs. In Million)	**SCORE**	**Value**	**SCORE**	**Value**	**SCORE**
Average Annual Turnover for last 3-years (as latest Audited accounts) of the Bidder or in the case of the Bidder being a JV/Consortium the aggregate of all the members of the JV Consortium						
For Annual Turnover of PKR 1,000,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Twenty Billion) (10 Marks)	7,192	10	23,209	10	7,035	10
For each increment of Rs. (Pakistan Rupees Fifty Million) (1 Mark) upto a maximum of 5 Marks	6,192	5	22,209	5	6,035	5
	AACT Marks	**15**		**15**		**15**
Minimum Net Worth of the Bidder or in the case of the Bidder being a JV/Consortium the aggregate of all the members of the JV Consortium						
For minimum net worth of PKR 350,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Three Fifty Million) (10 Marks)	9,378	10	61,076	10	7,212	10
For each increment of PKR 10,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Ten Million) (1 Mark upto a maximum of 5 Marks)	5,878	5	57,576	5	3,712	5
	Net Worth Marks	**15**		**15**		**15**
Financial Soundness Total Marks		**30**		**30**		**30**

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Link Bridge over River Indus connection Jhirk (Distt. Thatta and Mullah katiyar Dist6 Tando Mohd Khan) including approach roads and Construdtion of River Training Works	Strong		10 yrs	5128.000	>100%

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	2	12

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	7.00
	Total	**10**	**7.00**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification Experience	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Abdul Shakoor Palijo	1		No		>20	0.00
		Aslam Pervaiz Sh.	1	Yes			>20	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Shahzad Shakoor	2		Y		5<and>8	1.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Hasan Mustafa	1		CMA /Y		>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mr. Naseer Ahmad	1	LLB / Y			>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Shakeel Palijo	2		Y		>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Ghulam Mustafa Palijo	2	Y			>20	2.00
Total:			**10**					**7**

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile **M/s SIACO & SARCO JV**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Supply, Inspection, Installation, Testing, Commissioning Technical Support of 05 Toll Plazas	Strong	11.07.2018	10 yrs	883.000	>50%
2	O&M of Chenab Toll Plaza(N-5)	Strong	11.07.2018		197.100	
3	O&M of Mobile Weigh Stations (Package-VI)	Strong	30.04.2017		17.850	

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	10	20

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM **M/s SIACO & SARCO JV**

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	6.50
	Total	**10**	**6.50**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification Experience	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Engr. Shujah Khan	1		No		<8	0.00
		Engr. M. Jahanzeb Khan	1	Yes			<20	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Engr. Shahid Riaz Cheema	2	Yes			>10	2.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Mr.M Umar Khan	1		Yes		5<and>8	0.50
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mr. Riaz Hussain	1	LLB / Y			<5	0.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Engr. Ali Raza Babar	2	Yes			>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Engr. Hassan Mehmood Sheikh	2	Yes			>20	2.00
Total:			**10**					**6.50**

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile M/s ZKB

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Flyoveer at Kahna Kacha in PPP Mode	Strong		10 yrs	2994.000	>100%

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	2	12

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM M/s ZKB

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	8.50
	Total	**10**	**8.50**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Ahmad Luqman Sarwsr	2		Y		>20	1.00
		Dr Muhammad Zeeshan			Y		<10	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Kashif Khursheed	2		Y		>20	2.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Arslan Vardag	1		FCA	CA	>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mohammad Naeem Akbar Awan	1	LLB			5<and>8	0.50
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Maznzoor Ahmad Qureshi	2	Y/N			>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Abdul Latif	2	Y			>20	2.00
Total:			**10**					**8.50**

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-10I- FAISALABAD - SUMUNDARI - RAJHANAII- CANAL EXPRESSWAY FAISALABAD ROAD

UNDERSTANDING & INNOVATIVENESS / METHODOLOGY & WORK PLAN

1- Work Programme (5 Marks)

Sr. No.	CRITERIA	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	M/s ZKB	M/s SIACO & SARCO JV
		WORK PROGRAMME	WORK PROGRAMME	WORK PROGRAMME
1	How in-depth is the statement of Project Approach: does it fully cover the scope of the assignment and is it sufficiently developed to ensure assignment completion	0.8	0.83	0.5
2	Electronic Toll and Traffic Management (ETTMS)	0.6	0.75	0.5
3	Standard Operating Procedures (SOP)	0.5	0.8	0.3
4	Maintenance and Asset Preservation	0.5	0.8	0.8
5	Risk Identification, Mitigation,Traffic and Management	0.3	0.7	0.3
	Quaity and Environmental Management	0.8	0.5	0.3
5	**Total Weight:**	**3.50**	**4.38**	**2.70**

2- Work Methodology (5 Marks)

Sr. No.	CRITERIA	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	M/s ZKB	M/s SIACO & SARCO JV
		WORK METHODOLOGY	WORK METHODOLOGY	WORK METHODOLOGY
1	How in-depth is the statement of Project Approach: does it fully cover the scope of the assignment and is it sufficiently developed to ensure assignment completion	0.5	1	0.8
2	Quality Management and Method Statement	0.8	0.5	0.5
3	What is level of identification of potential risks that will affect the execution of the assignment, and what is the quality of the mitigation strategies proposed?	0.8	0.9	0.5
4	Traffic Diversion and Management	1	0.5	0.5
5	Safety and Environmental Management	1	0.3	0.3
	Total Weight:	**4.10**	**3.20**	**2.60**

Equipment

Sr No	Name of Machinery	Req. No	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES		M/s ZKB		M/s SIACO & SARCO JV	
				Ownership		Ownership		Ownership
1	Front End Loader 1.5m3	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
2	Dumper	3	Y	Owned	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
3	Grader 140 HP	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned	Y	>10-Y old
4	Combination Roller	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned	Y	>10-Y old
5	Water Tank Tow Type inc Tractor	3	Y	Leased	Y	Owned	Y	>10-Y old
6	Static Tandem Roller	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
7	PTR 9 wheeler	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned	Y	>10-Y old
8	Tractor	2	Y	Leased	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
9	Concrete Mixer	1	Y	Owned	Y	Owned	Y	>10-Y old
10	Excavator Track / wheel type	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned	Y	>10-Y old
	Obtained Marks		**7**		**10**		**6**	

If the Bidder possesses all the key equipment: 10 marks.

Note:

1 The marks mentioned in the above table are for owned equipment.

2 Total equipment available with the bidder is to be listed along with its current mobilization on on-going projects. The Bidder shall provide further details of proposed items of equipment using the relevant Form provided hereunder.

3 The bidder must submit ownership documents for equipment owned by it.

4 For Leased/Rental equipment, the bidder must submit lease/rental agreement(s).

5 For leased/rental equipment the bidder will get 50% marks.

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-10I- FAISALABAD - SUMUNDARI - RAJHANAII- CANAL EXPRESSWAY FAISALABAD ROAD

List of Similar Assignments

Name of Firm: - **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of		Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in Million)	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
			Start	Completion			Rs.350.000 M
1		Strong			< 10 yrs		> 80%
2							

Name of Firm: - **M/s ZKB**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of		Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in Million)	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
			Start	Completion			Rs.350.000 M
1		strong			< 10 yrs		> 80%
2							

SUMMARY OF SCORE EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODE
GROUP-11
FAISALABAD RING ROAD

Project Cost Rs. 500 Miilion (Approx)

Pass Marks : 70

Sr. No.	Firm Name	Financial Position (Max Marks =30)			Work Experience (Max Marks = 40)			Understanding & Innovation / Methodology (Max Marks = 10)			Project Team (Max Marks = 10)	Machinery (Max Score = 10)	Technical Score	Remarks
		AACT	NET WORTH	Total	Number of similar assignments	Value of similar assignments	Total	Work Programme	Work Methodology	Total				
1	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	12.00	20.00	**32.00**	3.50	4.10	**7.60**	**7.00**	**7.00**	**83.60**	**Qualified**
1	M/s ZKB	15.00	15.00	**30.00**	12.00	20.00	**32.00**	4.38	3.20	**7.58**	**8.50**	**10.00**	**88.08**	**Qualified**

AddlSecretary Tech III
Communication & Works Department

Rep. of
PPP Authority

Deputy Secretary (PC)
Communication & Works Department

Deputy Director PPP
Special Initiative
Department

Nayyar Saeed
PPP Consultant
C&W Department

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-11FAISALABAD RING ROAD

Financial Soundness				
Criteria	**M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**		**M/s ZKB**	
	Value (Rs. In Million)	**SCORE**	**Value**	**SCORE**
Average Annual Turnover for last 3-years (as latest Audited accounts) of the Bidder or in the case of the Bidder being a JV/Consortium the aggregate of all the members of the JV Consortium				
For Annual Turnover of PKR 1,000,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Twenty Billion) (10 Marks)	7,192	10	23,209	10
For each increment of Rs. (Pakistan Rupees Fifty Million) (1 Mark) upto a maximum of 5 Marks	6,192	5	22,209	5
	AACT Marks	**15**		**15**
Minimum Net Worth of the Bidder or in the case of the Bidder being a JV/Consortium the aggregate of all the members of the JV Consortium				
For minimum net worth of PKR 350,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Three Fifty Million) (10 Marks)	9,378	10	61,076	10
For each increment of PKR 10,000,000 (Pakistan Rupees Ten Million) (1 Mark upto a maximum of 5 Marks)	5,878	5	57,576	5
	Net Worth Marks	**15**		**15**
Financial Soundness Total Marks		**30**		**30**

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Link Bridge over River Indus connection Jhirk (Distt. Thatta and Mullah katiyar Dist6 Tando Mohd Khan) including approach roads and Construdtion of River Training Works	Strong		10 yrs	5128.000	>100%

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	2	12

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	7.00
	Total	**10**	**7.00**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification Experience	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Abdul Shakoor Palijo	1		No		>20	0.00
		Aslam Pervaiz Sh.	1	Yes			>20	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Shahzad Shakoor	2		Y		5<and>8	1.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Hasan Mustafa	1		CMA /Y		>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mr. Naseer Ahmad	1	LLB / Y			>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Shakeel Palijo	2		Y		>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Ghulam Mustafa Palijo	2	Y			>20	2.00
Total:			**10**					**7**

Summary of Technical Evaluation

1. Firm Profile M/s ZKB

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of Completion	Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
1	Flyover at Kahna Kacha in PPP Mode	Strong		10 yrs	2994.000	>100%

	5 Years' Experience (10 Marks)	Increment of 1-Year' Experience (2 Mark up to 10 Marks)	Total Marks
Similar Assignments	10	2	12

	Similar Project Value Rs.500 Million (15 Marks)	Increment of Rs. 100 Million (1 mark up to 5 mark)	Total Marks
Value of Similar Assignments	15	5	20

2. PROJECT TEAM M/s ZKB

		Max Score	Component Score
1	Education, qualifications & Experience	10	8.50
	Total	**10**	**8.50**

Education and qualifications

Sr. No.	Name of Post	Name of Person	Max Marks	Educational Qualification			Post Qualification	
				Bachelor Degree	Master Degree - Relevant Subject	P.hD/ CA	Time Spent in Similar Assignment (Years)	Marks Obtained
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
1	Transportation Engineer	Ahmad Luqman Sarwsr	2		Y		>20	1.00
		Dr Muhammad Zeeshan			Y		<10	0.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
2	Bridge & Structure Engineer	Kashif Khursheed	2		Y		>20	2.00
Marks Distribution					Y/N		Max 10	
3	Financial Specialist	Arslan Vardag	1		FCA	CA	>10	1.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
4	Legal Specialist	Mohammad Naeem Akbar Awan	1	LLB			5<and>8	0.50
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 10	
5	Maintenance Engineer	Maznzoor Ahmad Qureshi	2	Y/N			>10	2.00
Marks Distribution				Y/N			Max 20	
6	Project Manager	Abdul Latif	2	Y			>20	2.00
Total:			**10**					**8.50**

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-11FAISALABAD RING ROAD

UNDERSTANDING & INNOVATIVENESS / METHODOLOGY & WORK PLAN

1- Work Programme (5 Marks)

Sr. No.	CRITERIA	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	M/s ZKB
		WORK PROGRAMME	WORK PROGRAMME
1	How in-depth is the statement of Project Approach: does it fully cover the scope of the assignment and is it sufficiently developed to ensure assignment completion	0.8	0.83
2	Electronic Toll and Traffic Management (ETTMS)	0.6	0.75
3	Standard Operating Procedures (SOP)	0.5	0.8
4	Maintenance and Asset Preservation	0.5	0.8
5	Risk Identification, Mitigation,Traffic and Management	0.3	0.7
	Quaity and Environmental Management	0.8	0.5
5	**Total Weight:**	**3.50**	**4.38**

2- Work Methodology (5 Marks)

Sr. No.	CRITERIA	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES	M/s ZKB
		WORK METHODOLOGY	WORK METHODOLOGY
1	How in-depth is the statement of Project Approach: does it fully cover the scope of the assignment and is it sufficiently developed to ensure assignment completion	0.5	1
2	Quality Management and Method Statement	0.8	0.5
3	What is level of identification of potential risks that will affect the execution of the assignment, and what is the quality of the mitigation strategies proposed?	0.8	0.9
4	Traffic Diversion and Management	1	0.5
5	Safety and Environmental Management	1	0.3
	Total Weight:	**4.10**	**3.20**

Equipment

Sr No	Name of Machinery	Req. No	M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES		M/s ZKB	
				Ownership		Ownership
1	Front End Loader 1.5m3	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
2	Dumper	3	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
3	Grader 140 HP	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
4	Combination Roller	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
5	Water Tank Tow Type inc Tractor	3	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
6	Static Tandem Roller	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
7	PTR 9 wheeler	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
8	Tractor	2	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
9	Concrete Mixer	1	Y	Owned	Y	Owned
10	Excavator Track / wheel type	1	Y	Leased	Y	Owned
	Obtained Marks		**7**		**10**	

If the Bidder possesses all the key equipment: 10 marks.

Note:

1. The marks mentioned in the above table are for owned equipment.
2. Total equipment available with the bidder is to be listed along with its current mobilization on on-going projects. The Bidder shall provide further details of proposed items of equipment using the relevant Form provided hereunder.
3. The bidder must submit ownership documents for equipment owned by it.
4. For Leased/Rental equipment, the bidder must submit lease/rental agreement(s).
5. For leased/rental equipment the bidder will get 50% marks.

OPERATION AND MANAGEMENT CONTRACTS FOR ROADS IN PUNJAB ON PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP MODEGROUP-11FAISALABAD RING ROAD

List of Similar Assignments

Name of Firm: - **M/s KAINAT ENTERPRISES**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of		Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in Million)	Equivalance to our Assignment Cost
			Start	Completion			Rs.350.000 M
1		Strong			< 10 yrs		> 80%
2							

Name of Firm: - **M/s ZKB**

Sr. No.	Name of Project	Nature	Date of		Age Factor	Project Cost (Rs in Million)	Equivalance to our Assignment
			Start	Completion			Rs.350.000 M
1		strong			< 10 yrs		> 80%
2							