



CnW/ASCW/DSCW/O/260624/0403

SOPC(C&W)5-17/2026(PPP)(General)(Vol.II)

**GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB
COMMUNICATION & WORKS
DEPARTMENT**

Lahore,

Dated: 24th June, 2026

To,

1. Chief Executive Officer
Punjab Public Private Partnership Authority
2. Chief Engineer Special Initiative
Chief Engineer Special Initiative Department

Subject: MINUTES OF MEETING OF BID OPENING AND EVALUATION COMMITTEE (BOEC) FOR DUALIZATION OF CHINIOT – SARGODHA ROAD INCLUDING O&M OF FAISALABAD – CHINIOT ROAD, UNDER PPP MODE

I am directed to **enclose** a copy of Minutes of BOEC Meeting held on 23.06.2026 at 04:00 pm under the chairmanship of Additional Secretary (Technical – III), C&W in his office in C&W Department, Lahore on the subject noted above, for information and further required action.

CnW
Riffat Hina (SOPC - CnW)
sopc.cnw 39.49.140.247
24/6/2026 1:43:16 PM
(RIFFAT HINA)
SOPC - CNW
SOPC - CNW

CC:

A copy is forwarded for information and necessary action to the:-

1. Special Secretary (C&W) , (Minister Office CWD)
Communication & Works Department
2. AS (T-III) - CnW , (AS (T-III) - CnW)
Communication & Works Department
3. Chief Executive Officer (along with copy of Minutes of Meeting.)
Punjab Financial Advisory Service
4. **Consultant for PPPs in C&W Department, (along with copy of Minutes of Meeting.)
Near o/o Superintending Engineer, Highways Circle, Lahore.**
5. **M/s J.N & Co. along with copy of Minutes of Meeting.**
6. **M/s Abdul Waheed Khan & Co. (AWK) – Tayyab Manzoor Tarar Constructor (TMT)
– Sh. Abdr Razzaq & Co. ((SARCO) (JV) along with copy of Minutes of Meeting.)**
7. **M/s Zahid Khan & Brothers along with copy of Minutes of Meeting.**

8. ***M/s Kainatt Enterprises along with copy of Minutes of Meeting.***
9. ***M/s MBC & Sons, Yuksel Insaat A.S (JV) along with copy of Minutes of Meeting.***



MINUTES OF MEETING OF BID OPENING AND EVALUATION COMMITTEE (BOEC) FOR DUALIZATION OF CHINIOT – SARGODHA ROAD INCLUDING O&M OF FAISALABAD – CHINIOT ROAD, UNDER PPP MODE

The meeting on the subject was held on 23.06.2026 (Tuesday) at 04:00 pm under the chairmanship of Additional Secretary (Technical – III), C&W in Committee Room of C&W Department, Lahore. **(List of participants is attached).**

2. The following “Bid Opening and Evaluation Committee (BOEC)” was notified, in light of Rule 78 of “Punjab Public Private Partnership Rules 2025”, vide C&W Notification dated 11.03.2026;

i.	Additional Secretary (Tech-III), C&W Department	(Convener)
ii.	Deputy Secretary (PC), C&W Department	(Member/Secretary)
iii.	Representative of Chief Engineer, Punjab Special Initiatives Department	(Member)
iv.	Representative of PPP Authority, Government of the Punjab	(Member)
v.	Consultant PPP, C&W Department	(Member)
vi.	Any other co-opted member(s)	(Member)

Mr. Khalid Javed, Specialist Road Sector Projects was nominated as representative of “Punjab Public Private Partnership Authority (P4A)” and Mr. M. Shahbaz, Deputy Director (PPP) was nominated as representative of “Chief Engineer, Punjab Special Initiatives Department” to attend the subject meeting. Mr. Ilyas Shah, General Manager Infrastructure and Mr. Ahsan Bhatti, Legal Expert from P4A also attended the subject meeting.

3. The meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chair welcomed the participants. It was apprised that the bids were invited on “Single Stage, Three Envelope” bidding procedure under “Punjab Public Private Partnership (PPPP) Rules 2025”. Punjab Financial Advisory Services (PFAS) Authority being the “Transaction Advisors (TA)” evaluated the Financial Bidding documents as per laid down criteria and submitted its “Financial Bid Evaluation Report”. The main findings of the said report are as under;

(a) Financial Evaluation Criteria

#	Evaluation Factor	Basis of Scoring	Max Marks
1	Lowest Estimated Project Cost	Score = (Lowest Cost / Bidder Cost) × 30. Bidder quoting the lowest Estimated Project Cost receives full 30 marks; others scored proportionately.	30
2	Lowest Debit Authority Amount	Score = (Lowest DA / Bidder DA) × 30. Bidder quoting the lowest Debit Authority amount receives full 30 marks. DA cannot exceed 60% of outstanding debt principal.	30
3	Highest Minimum Revenue Share (MRS)	Score = (Bidder MRS / Highest MRS) × 40. MRS = % Revenue Shared × lower of BMR or ETR, discounted at 10% per annum commencing after Financing Termination Date.	40
TOTAL			100

(b) Consolidated Observations of the Financial Bids

Observation	AWK-TMT-SARCO JV	MBC-YUKSEL JV	J.N & Co.	ZKB	Kainatt Enterprises
Estimated Project Cost exceeds GoPb benchmark by > 4.5% (Rule 97(2)(b), PPP Rules 2025)	Exceeds benchmark	Exceeds benchmark	Exceeds benchmark	—	—
MRS discount rate of 10% post-FTD not correctly applied	—	Non-compliant	—	Non-compliant	Non-compliant
Incorrect / superseded toll rates applied	Non-compliant	—	—	Non-compliant	Non-compliant
Toll escalation not rounded to nearest PKR 5 (Schedule P)	Non-compliant	—	—	—	—
Prior-year BMR adopted for MRS calculation	—	Non-compliant	—	—	Non-compliant
Revenue base not independently derived from Schedule P rates and traffic model	—	Non-compliant	—	—	—
BOQ missing required material quantities (Form 10a Note)	—	—	—	Non-compliant	Non-compliant
Disclaimer in financial model introducing conditionality (RFP Section 6.1(l))	—	—	—	Non-compliant	—

4. The "Financial Bid Evaluation Report" submitted by PFAS was discussed at length during BOEC meeting. Based on the aforementioned evaluation results, the BOEC has noted that out of five, the four bidders (namely AWK-TMT-SARCO JV, MBC-YUKSEL JV, ZKB, and Kainatt Enterprises) are non-responsive because their Financial Proposals are inconsistent with one or more requirements of the RFP, therefore, a meaningful comparison of their Financial Proposals with each other is not possible. J.N & Co. is the only Bidder whose Financial Proposal is assessed as consistent with the RFP requirements, and is therefore the single compliant bid / most advantageous bid. However, its Estimated Project Cost exceeds the GoPb's Pre-Estimated Project Cost by more than the prescribed threshold under Rule 97(2)(b) of PPP Rules 2025.

5. In view of the foregoing, BOEC in its capacity has recommended that these findings may be forwarded to the Implementing Agency for publication.

6. Meeting ended with a vote of thanks.







COMMUNICATION & WORKS DEPARTMENT

MEETING OF BID OPENING AND EVALUATION COMMITTEE (BOEC)

FOR DUALIZATION OF CHINIOT SARGODHA ROAD INCLUDING O&M OF FAISALABAD CHINIOT ROAD (LENGTH=68KM) PROJECT UNDER PPP MODE

23rd June, 2026 (04:00 pm) for Financial Bid Evaluation

ATTENDANCE SHEET

Sr. No.	Name	Designation	Department / Firm	Contact #	Signature
1	Syed Moazzam Abbas Jabri	AST - III	C&W Dept.	0300 4479387	
2	M. AMMAR	DS (Pc)	C&W	0343-4870657	
3	M. SHAHBAZ	DD (PPP)	PSID LHR	0334-4376670	
4	Khalid Javed	Specialist Road Section	P4A	0333-4124688	
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					